GAO

**United States General Accounting Office** 

Fact Sheet for the Chairman, Legislation and National Security Subcommittee, Committee on Government Operations, House of Representatives

August 1990

# GSA AIRLINE CONTRACTS

Contract Awarded to Eastern Air Lines to Transport Government Travelers





United States General Accounting Office Washington, D.C. 20548

#### **General Government Division**

B-239936

August 17, 1990

The Honorable John Conyers, Jr. Chairman, Legislation and National Security Subcommittee Committee on Government Operations House of Representatives

Dear Mr. Chairman:

This fact sheet responds to your questions about the General Services Administration's (GSA) program that awards contracts to airlines for federal employees' travel between designated cities. You were concerned that Eastern Air Lines received a contract for travel services between specific pairs of cities even though it is reorganizing its operations under federal bankruptcy laws. Your questions covered three general areas including (1) GSA's contractor qualification and selection factors for awarding the airline travel contracts, (2) Eastern's 1990 contract award and contract performance, and (3) whether a contractor may sell its routes to another party.

Answers to your specific questions are summarized below; appendix I contains detailed responses. A schedule of Eastern's contract travel routes and the 1990 and 1989 contract prices is in appendix II.

### Background

GSA's Federal Supply Service (FSS) manages the program that provides airline services for federal employees. The program consists of an annual procurement with contract awards for travel between designated cities. Federal employees buy their travel tickets and are transported by contractors that receive awards. The program is commonly referred to as the city-pair program because the services provided are transportation between designated cities. The contracts that are awarded to provide this service are called city-pair contracts.

The current city-pair contracts cover the period from February 1, 1990, to January 31, 1991. For the current period, FSS awarded 21 contracts, valued at \$986 million, to 20 airlines and AMTRAK for travel on 3,000 city-pair routes. Eastern Air Lines was awarded a contract, valued at \$52 million, for 220 city-pair routes.

### Results in Brief

FSS is required to follow the basic criteria in the Federal Acquisition Regulation to evaluate a bidder's qualifications for a contract award. Contracting officers are required to consider several factors, including a prospective contractor's financial resources, ability to do the contract work, performance record on prior contracts, and integrity and business ethics.

rss's procedures for awarding city-pair contracts require a comparison of the service and price offered by bidders on routes between selected cities. Evaluation factors used in the selection process included bidders' conformance to Fss's flight time standards; frequency of service and distribution of flights in the morning, afternoon, and evening; fare price; and service to multiple airports in individual cities. For the 1990 contracts, bidders were notified that no awards would be made for service that was scheduled to start after January 2, 1990.

Although a prospective contractor may be reorganizing under federal bankruptcy laws, we have determined in our bid protest decisions that such reorganization does not automatically disqualify the contractor from receiving a contract. The question that must be answered by the contracting officer is whether the prospective contractor can fulfill the contract requirements while it is operating under the bankruptcy laws.

Regarding the contract award to Eastern Air Lines, the FSS contracting officer said he was aware of Eastern's bankruptcy status, had considered Eastern's ability to operate under bankruptcy laws on its prior contract, and had determined that Eastern was qualified for the current contract. As of April 1990, Eastern was servicing 219 of the 220 citypair routes included in its 1990 contract. Eastern had discontinued service on one route, a change which was allowed under the terms of the contract. Tickets were available for flights on 49 of the 51 routes we tested. On the remaining two routes, all coach class seats had been filled. Since the contract provides for the seating of federal employees in coach class seating, no seats were available at the government fare.

Federal law prohibits the transfer of a government contract from one contractor to a second contractor. However, the government may agree to the transfer if the second contractor's interest in the contract was caused by the transfer of (1) all the original contractor's assets or (2) the entire portion of the original contractor's assets involved in doing the contract. If the government does not agree to the transfer of a contract, the original contractor remains contractually obligated to the government. The government may terminate the contract for default if the

original contractor does not do the contract work. An example of how a sale of assets may be resolved occurred when Eastern sold the assets of its Air Shuttle to Trump Shuttle, Inc., in 1989. Trump, Eastern, and the government signed an agreement in which Trump agreed to service Eastern's contract routes for the remainder of the contract.

### Approach

Our work was done at FSS's headquarters in Arlington, Virginia, from April to June 1990. We reviewed contract and solicitation documents, analyzed the source selection process used in the award of Eastern's city-pair contract, verified that Eastern was servicing its contract city-pair routes, and interviewed contracting office personnel. Appendix III discusses our objectives, scope, and methodology in greater detail.

We discussed the information presented in this fact sheet with FSS officials, who agreed with the information we developed.

As arranged with the Subcommittee, copies of this fact sheet are being sent to the Administrator, GSA; Eastern Air Lines; and other interested parties.

The major contributors to this fact sheet are listed in appendix IV. If you have any questions, please call me on 275-8676.

Sincerely yours,

L. Nye Stevens

Director, Government Business

Mye Steven

**Operations Issues** 

### Contents

| Letter   |  |  | 1                               |
|--|--|--|---------------------------------|
| Appendix I<br>Answers to Questions                                     | Questic<br>Questic<br>Questic<br>Questic<br>Questic<br>Questic | on 2<br>on 3<br>on 4<br>on 5<br>on 6   | 6<br>6<br>7<br>8<br>8<br>9<br>9 |
| Appendix II<br>Information on<br>Eastern's 1990 City-<br>Pair Contract |  |  | 12                              |
| Appendix III<br>Objectives, Scope, and<br>Methodology                  |  |  | 20                              |
| Appendix IV<br>Major Contributors to<br>This Fact Sheet                |  |  | 22                              |
| Tables   | Table l  | I.1: Airlines With 1989 City-Pair Contracts<br>II.1: Schedule of Eastern Air Lines' 1990 City-Pair<br>Ontract  | 9                               |
|  | Abbre  | viations   |                                 |
|  | DOD<br>DOT<br>FAA<br>FAR<br>FSS<br>GSA                         | Department of Defense Department of Transportation Federal Aviation Administration Federal Acquisition Regulation Federal Supply Service General Services Administration |                                 |

|       |      |  |       | <br> |
|-------|------|--|-------|------|
| <br>- |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
| <br>  | <br> |  | · 0** | <br> |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |
|       |      |  |       |      |

### Answers to Questions

#### Question 1

What are the basic criteria GSA uses to determine an air transportation bidder's qualifications?

#### **Answer**

The Federal Property and Administrative Services Act (41 U.S.C. 253b) and the Armed Services Procurement Act (10 U.S.C. 2305), which were amended by the Competition in Contracting Act, require the award of contracts to "responsible" bidders and sources. Responsible means that the prospective contractor has the ability and the will to do the contract work and is eligible to receive a contract award.

According to the Federal Acquisition Regulation (FAR), "No purchase or award shall be made unless the contracting officer makes an affirmative determination of responsibility." To be determined responsible, a prospective contractor must meet general responsibility standards by

- having adequate financial resources or the ability to obtain them to perform the contract;
- having the ability to meet the required performance schedule;
- having a satisfactory performance record;
- having a satisfactory record of integrity and business ethics;
- having the necessary organization, experience, accounting and operational controls, and technical skills, or the ability to obtain them;
- having the necessary equipment and facilities or the ability to obtain them; and
- being otherwise qualified and eligible to receive an award under applicable laws and regulations. (See FAR Part 9.104.)

In addition to the general standards outlined in the FAR, FSS also specified several special standards for bidders for city-pair contracts to meet. These included a notification that the contractors must comply with all relevant rules and regulations of the Department of Transportation (DOT) as well as provisions of the Federal Aviation Act of 1958. Also, air carriers who were not approved by the Department of Defense (DOD) were required to fulfill the following requirements:

- have appropriate Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) certification;
- have adequate insurance;
- have at least 12 months' experience, immediately preceding request for approval, in the movement of passengers;
- be approved by the Military Traffic Management Command's Air Carrier Qualification Review Board; and
- successfully complete a Military Aircraft Command capability survey.

The requirement for DOD approval is included in 10 U.S.C. 2640 which authorizes DOD to suspend air carriers under contract with DOD for the charter air transportation of members of the armed forces.

With regard to Eastern Air Lines, the FSS contracting officer said that he followed the required criteria when making his responsibility determination. Specifically, in regard to Eastern's reorganization under federal bankruptcy laws he (1) checked with GSA's legal department about awarding a contract to a company operating under the bankruptcy laws, (2) evaluated the financial risk to the government and concluded that it was minimal, and (3) considered the fact that Eastern had been operating under the same financial conditions on its 1989 contract.

### Question 2

What factors are used to select the winning airlines for city-pair service?

#### Answer

FSS notified bidders that bids would be evaluated on the following factors, which are listed in descending order of importance:

- conformance to minimally acceptable flight time standards. FSS designates the minimum level of service for each city-pair route. Depending on the route, the minimum service may be listed as (1) non-stop service between points; (2) direct service involving no more than one stop between the cities; and (3) connecting service between cities with no more than one connecting flight segment, providing the connect time does not exceed 1-1/2 hours for domestic or 2-1/2 hours for international city-pairs;
- frequency of service and distribution of daily flights in the morning, afternoon, and evening between the hours of 7:00 a.m. and 10:00 p.m. On the basis of passengers per month information it receives from federal agencies, FSS determines the minimum number of flights per day that the winning contractor must provide and designates the minimum for each city-pair;
- · fare price; and
- service in cities with multiple airports when the multiple airports are not listed as separate routes.

FSS also notified bidders that it (1) may verify the flight schedules of bidders, (2) had the right to eliminate bidders for particular routes where it appeared that a bidder's planned service on those routes was

not bona fide, (3) might award a city-pair contract to an airline that significantly exceeded the minimum requirements even though the airline was not the low fare bidder, and (4) might make more than one award for a city-pair if no single airline could provide the minimum level of service.

All proposed flight schedules had to begin service by January 2, 1990, to be considered for award. The contract period started on February 1, 1990.

In its selection of Eastern Air Lines for 220 routes, FSS verified Eastern's flights using Scorpio—United Airlines' electronic reservation system—and selected Eastern on the basis of price or quality of service on its contract routes.

#### Question 3

Did Eastern Air Lines actively service the routes it bid on at the time it bid? To what extent did the contracting officer have to take Eastern's actual (as opposed to prospective) flights into account?

#### Answer

Neither Eastern nor any other bidder was required to service the routes it submitted bids on at the time bids were submitted to FSS. However, all proposed flights had to be in operation by January 2, 1990.

FSS requested bids on July 25, 1989, and all bids were due by September 7, 1989. FSS notified bidders that "No awards will be made for service scheduled to commence later than January 2, 1990." Therefore, to be considered for award. service on proposed routes had to be in operation by January 2, 1990.

### Question 4

Are there precedents for selecting a contractor that is bankrupt?

#### Answer

The fact that a contractor is reorganizing under federal bankruptcy laws does not require a finding of nonresponsibility. The appropriate question is whether the contractor has the financial capability or can obtain the financial capability to do the contract work in spite of operating under the bankruptcy laws. For examples of past cases stating this precedent, see Comptroller General Decisions B-228396.4, 88-2 CPD 89,

7/27/88; B-228552, 88-1 CPD 56, 1/20/88; and B-225469, 87-1 CPD 97, 1/29/87.

FSS awarded 1990 contracts to two airlines that were operating under the bankruptcy laws—Eastern Air Lines and Braniff, Inc. However, Braniff, Inc., has since ceased operations.

### Question 5

What carriers were displaced by Eastern's selection?

#### Answer

Nine other airlines had 1989 contracts for Eastern's current city-pairs. (Eastern also had a prior contract.) Table I shows how many city-pairs the prior airlines serviced.

### Table I.1: Airlines With 1989 City-Pair Contracts

| Airline                                  | Number of city-pairs |
|--|----------------------|
| Eastern                                  | 111                  |
| Delta                                    | 33                   |
| USAir                                    | 27                   |
| American                                 | 15                   |
| Northwest                                | 8                    |
| Braniff                                  | 2                    |
| Continental                              | 2                    |
| United                                   | 1                    |
| Pan Am World Airways                     |                      |
| Trans World                              | 1                    |
| Eastern and Pan Am shared                | 1                    |
| Subtotal                                 | 202                  |
| New city-pair routes on current contract | 18                   |
| Total                                    | 220                  |

### Question 6

What is the current status of Eastern's city-pair contracts?

#### Answer

We compared all of Eastern's 220 city pair routes with the April 1990 edition of the Federal Travel Directory to determine if Eastern was servicing its routes. We found that Eastern was servicing 219 of the city-pair routes. Eastern discontinued service for the remaining Florence,

South Carolina, to Miami city-pair route. Under the contract provisions, airlines are allowed to discontinue service to city-pairs.

In addition, we checked 51 city-pair routes to determine if we could get next-day reservations on an Eastern flight, at the government fare. On 49 of the 51 city-pair routes, Eastern offered seats on flights at the government fare. However, on two of the flights, all coach class seats were filled. Since the contract provides for government fares only in coach class seats, no tickets were available at the government fare.

#### Question 7

If Eastern sells its routes, do the GSA contracts convey?

#### Answer

#### Title 41 U.S.C. 15 of the United States Code states that

"No contract or order, or any interest therein, shall be transferred by the party to whom such contract or order is given to any other party, and any such transfer shall cause the annulment of the contract or order transferred, so far as the United States are concerned. All rights of action, however, for any breach of such contract by the contracting parties, are reserved to the United States."

#### FAR Part 42.1204 says that the

"Government may, in its interest, recognize a third party as the successor in interest to a Government contract when the third party's interest in the contract arises out of the transfer of (1) all the contractor's assets or (2) the entire portion of the assets involved in performing the contract.... When it is in the Government's interest not to concur in the transfer of a contract from one company to another company, the original contractor remains under contractual obligation to the Government, and the contract may be terminated for reasons of default, should the original contractor not perform."

When the government recognizes a successor contractor, a new agreement called a novation agreement is signed to indicate the successor's assumption of all the obligations under the contract.

In 1989, Trump Shuttle, Inc., acquired all of the assets of Eastern's high frequency airline service that operated between New York's LaGuardia Airport and each of Boston's Logan and Washington, D.C.'s National Airports under the names "Eastern Air Shuttle" and "Air-Shuttle." Trump

Appendix I
Answers to Questions

Shuttle, Inc.; Eastern Air Lines, Inc.; and the government signed a novation agreement for Trump Shuttle, Inc., to assume Eastern's contract

responsibilities for the "Shuttle" routes.

### Information on Eastern's 1990 City-Pair Contract

Table II.1 shows the city-pairs on Eastern's 1990 contract and price changes between the 1989 contracts and Eastern's 1990 contract. A list of coded abbreviation meanings immediately follows the table.

| Route number | City-pair | Prior<br>airline | Prior airline's<br>1989 price | Eastern's<br>1990 price | Percentage 1990<br>price is lower<br>than 1989 price | Percentage 1990<br>price is higher<br>than 1989 price |
|--------------|-----------|------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------|--|---|
| 122          | ABE/MSY   | CO               | \$195                         | \$178                   | 8.72   |   |
| 148          | AGS/ATL   | DL               | 66                            | 63                      | 4.55   |   |
| 2910         | AGS/CHI   | XX               |                               | 149                     |  |   |
| 2912         | AGS/SDF   | XX               |                               | 138                     |  |   |
| 253          | AGS/TYS   | US               | 94                            | 97                      |  | 3.19  |
| 258          | AGS/WAS   | US               | 127                           | 128                     |  | 0.79  |
| 3            | ALB/ATL   | EA               | 157                           | 148                     | 5.73   |   |
| 144          | ATL/AVL   | EA               | 89                            | 87                      | 2.25   |   |
| 181          | ATL/BDL   | EA               | 166                           | 158                     | 4.82   |   |
| 207          | ATL/BNA   | EA               | 81                            | 78                      | 3.70   |   |
| 152          | ATL/BOS   | EA               | 181                           | 178                     | 1.66   |   |
| 153          | ATL/BUF   | EA               | 159                           | 158                     | 0.63   |   |
| 242          | ATL/BWI   | EA               | 119                           | 119                     | 0.00   | 0.00  |
| 161          | ATL/CAE   | EA               | 65                            | 68                      |  | 4.62  |
| 157          | ATL/CHA   | DL               | 90                            | 76                      | 15.56  |   |
| 160          | ATL/CLE   | EA               | 149                           | 148                     | 0.67   |   |
| 162          | ATL/CMH   | EA               | 146                           | 148                     |  | 1.37  |
| 166          | ATL/DAB   | EA               | 108                           | 98                      | 9.26   |   |
| 172          | ATL/FLL   | EA               | 125                           | 118                     | 5.60   |   |
| 173          | ATL/FMY   | EA               | 132                           | 128                     | 3.03   |   |
| 176          | ATL/GNV   | EA               | 143                           | 138                     | 3.50   |   |
| 179          | ATL/GPT   | ΕA               | 130                           | 129                     | 0.77   |   |
| 177          | ATL/GSO   | EA               | 96                            | 98                      |  | 2.08  |
| 184          | ATL/IND   | EA               | 119                           | 118                     | 0.84   | ·   |
| 186          | ATL/JAX   | EA               | - 88                          | 98                      |  | 11.36   |
| 216          | ATL/MCO   | EA               | 75                            | 79                      | · ·- ·- ·- ·- ·- ·- ·- ·- ·- ·- ·- ·- ·-             | 5.33  |
| 204          | ATL/MGM   | DL               | 69                            | 66                      | 4.35   |   |
| 200          | ATL/MIA   | EA               | 124                           | 118                     | 4.84   |   |
| 187          | ATL/MKC   | BN               | 158                           | 138                     | 12.66  |   |
| 197          | ATL/MLB   | EA               | 120                           | 118                     | 1.67   |   |
| 206          | ATL/MYR   | EA               | 130                           | 98                      | 24.62  |   |
| 210          | ATL/NYC   | EA               | 143                           | 139                     | 2.80   |   |
| 212          | ATL/ORF   | EA               | 82                            | 89                      |  | 8.54  |
|              |           |                  |                               |                         |  | (continued)   |

Appendix II Information on Eastern's 1990 City-Pair Contract

| Route number | City-pair | Prior<br>airline | Prior airline's<br>1989 price | Eastern's<br>1990 price | Percentage 1990<br>price is lower<br>than 1989 price | Percentage 1990<br>price is higher<br>than 1989 price |
|--------------|-----------|------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------|--|---|
| 241          | ATL/PBI   | EA               | 138                           | 128                     | 7.25   |   |
| 217          | ATL/PFN   | EA               | 89                            | 87                      | 2.25   |   |
| 219          | ATL/PHL   | US               | 147                           | 138                     | 6.12   |   |
| 220          | ATL/PHX   | EA               | 219                           | 199                     | 9.13   |   |
| 221          | ATL/PIT   | US               | 147                           | 138                     | 6.12   |   |
| 218          | ATL/PNS   | EA               | 79                            | 88                      |  | 11.39   |
| 225          | ATL/RIC   | EA               | 175                           | 168                     | 4.00   |   |
| 195          | ATL/SDF   | <br>DL           | 102                           | 98                      | 3.92   |   |
| 238          | ATL/TLH   | DL               | 91                            | 98                      |  | 7.69  |
| 239          | ATL/TPA   | EA               | 89                            | 98                      |  | 10.11   |
| 188          | ATL/TYS   | DL               | 70                            | 68                      | 2.86   |   |
| 175          | ATL/VPS   | EA               | 90                            | 89                      | 1.11   |   |
| 243          | ATL/WAS   | DL               | 129                           | 129                     | 0.00   | 0.00  |
| 1426         | BDL/JAX   | US               | 114                           | 128                     |  | 12.28   |
| 1449         | BDL/SAV   | EA               | 103                           | 108                     |  | 4.85  |
| 328          | BHM/CAE   | EA               | 105                           | 98                      | 6.67   |   |
| 330          | BHM/DAB   | EA               | 116                           | 108                     | 6.90   |   |
| 345          | BHM/EWR   | EA               | 160                           | 158                     | 1.25   |   |
| 334          | BHM/GNV   | EA               | 156                           | 148                     | 5.13   |   |
| 338          | BHM/JAX   | US               | 184                           | 168                     | 8.70   |   |
| 342          | BHM/MIA   | FA               | 131                           | 128                     | 2.29   |   |
| 344          | BHM/NYC   | US               | 122                           | 128                     |  | 4.92  |
| 346          | BHM/ORF   | EA               | 134                           | 128                     | 4.48   |   |
| 348          | BHM/PHL   | EA               | 168                           | 158                     | 5.95   |   |
| 352          | BHM/SAV   | EA               | 122                           | 118                     | 3.28   |   |
| 357          | BHM/WAS   | DL               | 132                           | 129                     | 2.27   |   |
| 549          | BNA/CHS   | EA               | 131                           | 128                     | 2.29   |   |
| 1099         | BNA/DAB   | EA               | 138                           | 128                     | 7.25   |   |
| 1352         | BNA/FLL   | EA               | 137                           | 128                     | 6.57   |   |
| 2142         | BNA/NYC   | AA               | 120                           | 118                     | 1.67   |   |
| 2147         | BNA/ORL   | AA               | 174                           | 168                     | 3.45   |   |
| 2159         | BNA/PBI   | AA               | 220                           | 208                     | 5.45   |   |
| 2148         | BNA/PNS   | NW               | 100                           | 108                     |  | 8.00  |
| 2155         | BNA/SAV   | EA               | 129                           | 128                     | 0.78   |   |
| 2157         | BNA/TLH   | EA               | 127                           | 118                     | 7.09   |   |
| 385          | BOS/CAE   | US               | 87                            | 88                      |  | 1.15  |
| 429          | BOS/PNS   | EA               | 249                           | 238                     | 4.42   |   |
| 447          | BOS/SAV   | US               | 101                           | 108                     |  | 6.93  |
| 413          | BOS/SDF   | DL               | 150                           | 148                     | 1.33   | 3.00  |
|              | i         |                  |                               |                         |  | (continued)   |

Appendix II Information on Eastern's 1990 City-Pair Contract

| ercentage 1990<br>price is higher<br>than 1989 price | Percentage 1990<br>price is lower<br>than 1989 price | Eastern's<br>1990 price | Prior airline's<br>1989 price | Prior<br>airline | City-pair | Route number |
|--|--|-------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|-----------|--------------|
|  | 10.55  | 178                     | 199                           | US               | BOS/TLH   | 454          |
|  | 5.26   | 198                     | 209                           | EA               | BOS/VPS   | 397          |
|  | 0.84   | 118                     | 119                           | EA               | BUF/CAE   | 488          |
| 9.52   |  | 138                     | 126                           | US               | BUF/PBI   | 511          |
| 6.67   |  | 128                     | 120                           | EA               | BWI/DAB   | 1127         |
|  | 5.39   | 158                     | 167                           | AA               | BWI/MOB   | 2116         |
|  | 3.26   | 178                     | 184                           | EA               | BWI/PNS   | 2436         |
|  | 3.28   | 118                     | 122                           | EA               | BWI/SAV   | 2680         |
|  | 0.84   | 118                     | 119                           | UA               | CAE/CHI   | 623          |
|  | 4.07   | 118                     | 123                           | EA               | CAE/HSV   | 840          |
| 0.00   | 0.00   | 138                     | 138                           | US               | CAE/IND   | 841          |
|  | 3.57   | 108                     | 112                           | EA               | CAE/JAX   | 842          |
|  | 1.54   | 128                     | 130                           | US               | CAE/MCO   | 858          |
|  | 0.50   | 198                     | 199                           | EA               | CAE/MKE   | 848          |
| <del></del>  | 2.47   | 158                     | 162                           | EA               | CAE/MSY   | 851          |
| 18.68  |  | 108                     | 91                            | US               | CAE/NYC   | 853          |
|  | 4.42   | 108                     | 113                           | DL               | CAE/SDF   | 847          |
| 1.59   |  | 128                     | 126                           | US               | CHA/WAS   | 612          |
|  | 3.90   | 148                     | 154                           | EA               | CHI/DAB   | 628          |
|  |  | 159                     |                               | XX               | CHI/MLB   | 2939         |
|  |  | 169                     |                               | XX               | CHI/PFN   | 2945         |
| 0.00   | 0.00   | 98                      | 98                            | US               | CHI/SAV   | 694          |
| 2.6  |  | 118                     | 115                           | EA               | CHS/DAB   | 532          |
| 3.48   |  | 119                     | 115                           | . EA             | CHS/FLL   | 536          |
|  | 4.52   | 148                     | 155                           | EA               | CHS/MSY   | 550          |
|  | 3.50   | 138                     | 143                           | EA               | CHS/NYC   | 552          |
|  | 1.54   | 128                     | 130                           | EA               | CHS/PNS   | 558          |
|  | 3.27   | 148                     | 153                           | EA               | CHS/TPA   | 566          |
|  | 7.50   | 148                     | 160                           | DL               | CHS/TYS   | 543          |
|  | 4.83   | 138                     | 145                           | <br>AA           | CLE/JAX   | 760          |
| 0.0  | 0.00   | 248                     | 248                           | DL               | CLE/PNS   | 770          |
|  | 33.33  | 208                     | 312                           | US               | CLT/SFO   | 601          |
| 0.5  |  | 178                     | 177                           | US               | CMH/JAX   | 880          |
| 1.8  |  | 218                     | 214                           | DL               | CMH/PNS   | 890          |
|  | 4.17   | 138                     | 144                           | EA               | CMH/SAV   | 898          |
|  | 1.54   | 128                     | 130                           | EA               | DAB/HSV   | 1084         |
|  | 5.73   | 148                     | 157                           | EA               | DAB/IND   | 1085         |
|  | 1.66   | 178                     | 181                           | EA               | DAB/MKE   | 1096         |
|  | 4.82   | 158                     | 166                           | DL               | DAB/MOB   | 1098         |

Appendix II Information on Eastern's 1990 City-Pair Contract

| Route number | City-pair | Prior<br>airline | Prior airline's<br>1989 price | Eastern's<br>1990 price | Percentage 1990<br>price is lower<br>than 1989 price | Percentage 1990<br>price is higher<br>than 1989 price |
|--------------|-----------|------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------|--|---|
| 1100         | DAB/MSY   | EA               | 140                           | 138                     | 1.43   |   |
| 1102         | DAB/NYC   |                  | 115                           | 118                     |  | 2.61  |
| 1104         | DAB/ORF   | EA               | 104                           | 108                     |  | 3.85  |
| 1112         | DAB/PDX   |                  | 270                           | 268                     | 0.74   |   |
| 1109         | DAB/PHL   | EA               | 103                           | 108                     |  | 4.85  |
| 1111         | DAB/PIT   | EA               | 124                           | 128                     |  | 3.23  |
| 1113         | DAB/RDU   | AA               | 117                           | 118                     | · · · ·  | 0.85  |
| 1120         | DAB/SAV   | EA               | 89                            | 98                      |  | 10.11   |
| 1093         | DAB/SDF   | DL               | 170                           | 158                     | 7.06   |   |
| 1121         | DAB/SEA   | EA               | 270                           | 268                     | 0.74   |   |
| 1118         | DAB/SFO   | EA               | 252                           | 248                     | 1.59   |   |
| 1119         | DAB/SJU   | XX               |                               | 199                     |  |   |
| 1123         | DAB/STL   |                  | 193                           | 178                     | 7.77   |   |
| 1088         | DAB/TYS   | DL               | 197                           | 188                     | 4.57   |   |
| 1128         | DAB/WAS   | - —<br>EA        | 113                           | 118                     |  | 4.42  |
| 1270         | DHN/PHX   | DL               | 265                           | 258                     | 2.64   |   |
| 1271         | DHN/WAS   | <br>EA           | 189                           | 188                     | 0.53   |   |
| 1230         | DTT/MLB   | ĀĀ               | 216                           | 204                     | 5.56   |   |
| 1245         | DTT/PNS   | NW               | 149                           | 148                     | 0.67   |   |
| 1354         | FLL/NYC   | EA               | 143                           | 138                     | 3.50   |   |
| 1259         | DTT/SAV   | US               | 160                           | 146                     | 8.75   |   |
| 1262         | DTT/TLH   | EA               | 163                           | 158                     | 3.07   |   |
| 2268         | EWR/PNS   | EA               | 183                           | 178                     | 2.73   |   |
| 2287         | EWR/SAV   | EA               | 122                           | 118                     | 3.28   |   |
| 1351         | FLL/MOB   | EA               | 187                           | 178                     | 4.81   |   |
| 1365         | FLL/RDU   | AA               | 168                           | 154                     | 8.33   |   |
| 1371         | FLL/SAV   | DL               | 193                           | 180                     | 6.74   |   |
| 1373         | FLL/STL   | TW               | 197                           | 184                     | 6.60   |   |
| 1330         | FLO/MIA   | XX               |                               | 178                     |  |   |
| 1379         | FMY/LAX   | EA               | 334                           | 328                     | 1.80   |   |
| 1406         | GPT/HSV   | NW               | 160                           | 146                     | 8.75   |   |
| 1398         | GSP/MSY   | EA .             | 143                           | 138                     | 3.50   |   |
| 1400         | GSP/NYC   | E.A              | 133                           | 138                     |  | 3.76  |
| 1526         | HSV/EWR   | EA               | 156                           | 148                     | 5.13   |   |
| 1529         | HSV/MCO   | DL               | 172                           | 157                     | 8.72   |   |
| 1536         | HSV/PBI   | DL               | 173                           | 159                     | 8.09   |   |
| 1546         | IND/JAX   | EA               | 164                           | 158                     | 3.66   |   |
| 1551         | IND/MIA   | BN               | 158                           | 148                     | 6.33   |   |
| 1574         | IND/PBI   | DL               | 197                           | 184                     | 6.60   |   |
|              | ·i        |                  |                               |                         |  | (continued  |

| Route number | City-pair | Prior<br>airline | Prior airline's<br>1989 price | Eastern's<br>1990 price | Percentage 1990<br>price is lower<br>than 1989 price | Percentage 1990<br>price is higher<br>than 1989 price |
|--------------|-----------|------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------|--|---|
| 1559         | IND/PNS   | NW               | 142                           | 138                     | 2.82   |   |
| 1569         | IND/SAV   | US               | 178                           | 164                     | 7.87   |   |
| 1572         | IND/TLH   | EA               | 176                           | 168                     | 4.55   |   |
| 1608         | JAX/MSY   | EA               | 171                           | 168                     | 1.75   | <del></del> -   |
| 1610         | JAX/NYC   | EA               | 107                           | 108                     | ······   | 0.93  |
| 1623         | JAX/PVD   | US               | 117                           | 128                     |  | 9.40  |
| 1641         | JAX/WAS   | EA               | 96                            | 98                      |  | 2.08  |
| 1855         | LAX/MCO   | DL               | 208                           | 195                     | 6.25   |   |
| 1918         | LAX/TLH   | XX               |                               | 218                     |  |   |
| 2132         | MGM/NYC   | EA               | 195                           | 182                     | 6.67   | <del></del>   |
| 2019         | MIA/BNA   | AA               | 128                           | 138                     |  | 7.81  |
| 2018         | MIA/MOB   | EA               | 187                           | 178                     | 4.81   |   |
| 2032         | MIA/RDU   | AA               | 101                           | 108                     |  | 6.93  |
| 2040         | MIA/SAV   | DL               | 142                           | 148                     |  | 4.23  |
| 2039         | MIA/SJU   | EA               | 122                           | 119                     | 2.46   |   |
| 2046         | MIA/STT   | EA               | 154                           | 149                     | 3.25   |   |
| 1702         | MIA/TYS   | EA               | 154                           | 148                     | 3.90   |   |
| 2050         | MIA/WAS   | DL               | 149                           | 139                     | 6.71   |   |
| 2064         | MKE/PBI   | AA               | 157                           | 148                     | 5.73   |   |
| 1983         | MLB/PHL   | CO               | 149                           | 148                     | 0.67   |   |
| 2105         | MOB/EWR   | EA               | 189                           | 188                     | 0.53   |   |
| 2104         | MOB/NYC   | EA               | 102                           | 108                     |  | 5.88  |
| 2115         | MOB/PBI   | EA               | 154                           | 148                     | 3.90   |   |
| 2108         | MOB/PHL   | EA               | 162                           | 158                     | 2.47   |   |
| 2117         | MOB/WAS   | DL               | 151                           | 149                     | 1.32   |   |
| 2175         | MSY/RDU   | US               | 158                           | 144                     | 8.86   |   |
| 2177         | MSY/RIC   | US               | 181                           | 167                     | 7.73   |   |
| 2184         | MSY/SAV   | EA               | 185                           | 178                     | 3.78   |   |
| 1704         | MSY/TYS   | NW               | 180                           | 166                     | 7.78   |   |
| 2206         | NYC/PHX   | EΛ               | 144                           | 148                     |  | 2.78  |
| 2202         | NYC/PNS   | NW               | 180                           | 166                     | 7.78   |   |
| 2238         | NYC/SAV   | DL               | 125                           | 138                     |  | 10.40   |
| 2317         | ORF/ORL   | EA               | 112                           | 118                     |  | 5.36  |
| 3065         | ORF/PFN   | XX               |                               | 148                     |  |   |
| 3070         | ORF/SAV   | XX               | <del></del>                   | 148                     |  |   |
| 1951         | ORF/SDF   | US               | 168                           | 154                     | 8.33   | <del></del> ································          |
| 2335         | ORF/TPA   | US               | 111                           | 108                     | 2.70   |   |
| 2486         | PBI/PHX   | DL               | 219                           | 207                     | 5.48   |   |
| 2541         | PBI/RDU   | AA               | 128                           | 138                     |  | 7.81  |
|              |           |                  |                               |                         |  | (continued)   |

Appendix II Information on Eastern's 1990 City-Pair Contract

| Route number | City-pair | Prior<br>airline   | Prior airline's<br>1989 price   | Eastern's<br>1990 price | Percentage 1990<br>price is lower<br>than 1989 price | Percentage 1990<br>price is higher<br>than 1989 price |
|--------------|-----------|--------------------|---------------------------------|-------------------------|--|---|
| 2679         | PBI/SAV   | DL                 | 199                             | 186                     | 6.53   |   |
| 2732         | PBI/WAS   | US                 | 121                             | : 18                    | 2.48   |   |
| 2419         | PFN/WAS   | EFA                | 1 Ĉ .                           | 188                     | 1.57   |   |
| 2420         | PFN/WAS   | F: 7.              | ٠,٤,٠                           | 188                     | 0.53   |   |
| 2424         | PHL/PNS   | έX                 |                                 | 138                     |  |   |
| 1382         | PHX/VPS   | MV.                | 26                              | 256                     | 1 54   |   |
| 2426         | PIT/PNS   | K.                 |                                 | -38                     |  |   |
| 2498         | PIT/SAV   | $\Delta \hat{\mu}$ | +                               | 140                     | 9.68   |   |
| 2497         | PIT/SJU   | ĘΑ                 | 201                             | 248                     |  | 11.71   |
| 2427         | PNS/PVD   | 0:                 | <u> 2</u> 93                    | 283                     | 3.41   |   |
| 1952         | PNS/SDF   | )ı                 | * + 16                          | 183                     | 6.63   |   |
| 1710         | RDU/TYS   | A./                | $\mathbf{i}_{-\frac{1}{2}})$    | 138                     |  | 0.73  |
| 2571         | RIC/STL   | Dι                 | 1.37                            | 146                     | 8.75   |   |
| 2676         | SAV/STL   | F/                 | 1.75                            | 168                     | 5.62   |   |
| 2678         | SAV/TPA   | € 4.               | 1 11                            | 108                     |  | 6.93  |
| 1715         | SAV/TYS   | M                  | 1                               | 145                     | 8.81   |   |
| 2681         | SAV/WAS   | Ī                  | 11.                             | 118                     |  | 5.36  |
| 3035         | SDF/MSY   | X÷                 |                                 | 149                     |  |   |
| 1953         | SDF/PHL   | U 3                | 1 -{                            | 174                     | 6.95   |   |
| 3037         | SDF/RIC   | ×K                 |                                 | 159                     |  |   |
| 1961         | SDF/TPA   | f A                | *1.00                           | 150                     | 8.54   |   |
| 2644         | SFO/TPA   | x <                |                                 | 178                     |  |   |
| 2670         | SJU/WAS   | FX                 | (4)                             | 2 <b>2</b> 8            |  | 53.02   |
| 2987         | VPS/MCO   | × <                |                                 | 168                     |  |   |
| 2985         | VPS/MIA   | х 🤇                |                                 | 208                     |  |   |
| 2988         | VPS/STL   | Х×                 |                                 | -48                     |  |   |
| 2989         | VPS/TPA   | Х×                 |                                 | 178                     |  |   |
| 1387         | VPS/WAS   | N.W                | · (pr)                          | 177                     | 6.84   |   |
| 2794         | MIA/PTY   | , v                | 94° -                           | 215                     | 9.28   | ····  |
|              | · '       | ИA                 | <u>1</u> 10.                    | 215                     | 6.11   |   |
| 2817         | NYC/YUL   | ÷A                 | 7.4                             | <b>8</b> 8              |  | 11.39   |
| 2889         | SJO/WAS   | ı.'Δ               | χ( <sup>2</sup> 1\ <sup>3</sup> | 245                     | 5.41   |   |

Key

#### Airlines

4A American BN Braniff TO Continental 1.4. Delta

į A î.astem

NW Northwest

Pan American World - wai/s Trans World DV

IW

UΑ

United

US USAir Indicates new route on current contract. XXCities ABE Allentown, Pa. AGS Augusta, Ga. ALB Albany, N.Y. AVL Asheville, N.C. BDL Hartford, Conn BHM Birmingham, Ala BNA Nashville, Tenn. BOS Boston, Mass. BUF Buffalo, N.Y. BWI Washington, D.C CAE Columbia, S.C. CHA Chattanooga, Tenn. CHI Chicago, II. CHS Charleston, S.C. CLE Cleveland, Ohio CLT Charlotte, N.C. CMH Columbus, Ohio DAB Daytona Beach, Florida DHN Dothan Ala. DTT Detroit, Mich. EWR Newark, N.J. FLL Fort Lauderdale, Fla. FLO Florence, S.C. FMY Fort Myers, Fla GNV Gainesville, Fla. GPT Gulfport Miss GSO Greensboro, N.C. HSV Huntsville-Decatur, Ala IND Indianapolis, Ind JAX Jacksonville, Fla. LAX Los Angeles, Calif MCO Orlando, Fla. MGM Montgomery, Ala MIA Miami, Fla. MKC Kansas City, Mo. MKE Milwaukee, Wis. MLB Melbourne, Fla. MOB Mobile, Ala. MSY New Orleans, La. MYR Myrtle Beach, S.C. NYC New York, N.Y. ORF Norfolk, Va. ORL Orlando, Fla PBI West Palm Beach, Fla. PDX Portland, Ore. PFN Panama City, Fla PHL Philadelphia, Pa. PHX Phoenix, Ariz PIT Pittsburgh, Pa PNS Pensacola, Fla. PTY Panama City, Panama PVD Providence, R.I. RIC Richmond, Va.

Page 18

RDU Raleigh-Durham, N.C SAV Savannah, Ga. SDF Louisville, Ky. Appendix II Information on Eastern's 1990 City-Pair Contract

SEA Seattle-Tacoma, Wash SFO San Francisco, Calif. SJO San Jose, Costa Rica SJU San Juan, P.R. STL St. Louis, Mo. STT St. Thomas, V.I. TLH Tallahassee, Fla. TPA Tampa, Fla. TYS Knoxville, Tenn. VPS Ft. Walton Beach, Fla. WAS Washington, D.C. YUL Montreal, Canada

### Objectives, Scope, and Methodology

Our objective was to answer the following questions asked by the Chairman, Legislation and National Security Subcommittee, House Committee on Government Operations.

- 1. What are the basic criteria GSA uses to determine an air transportation bidder's qualifications?
- 2. What factors are used to select the winning airline for city-pair service?
- 3. Did Eastern Air Lines actively service the routes it bid on at the time it bid? To what extent did the contracting officer have to take Eastern's actual (as opposed to prospective) flights into account?
- 4. Are there precedents for selecting a bankrupt contractor?
- 5. What carriers were displaced by Eastern's selection?
- 6. What is the current status of Eastern's city-pair contracts?
- 7. If Eastern sells its routes, do the GSA contracts convey?

To answer questions 1 and 4, we reviewed the FAR, GAO bid protest decisions, the solicitation document for the city-pair contracts, and interviewed the FSS contracting officer who awarded the Eastern contract.

To answer questions 2, 3, and 5, we reviewed the document FSS used to solicit offers for the city-pair contracts and the source selection documents FSS used to select the 220 city-pair routes included in Eastern's contract.

To answer question 6, we determined if Eastern was servicing its city-pair routes by verifying that its city-pair routes were included in the April 1990 edition of the Federal Travel Directory. Additionally, we selected 52 city-pair routes to determine if we could get reservations on Eastern flights at the government fare. The 52 routes were selected by picking 1 city-pair route from each city that was listed first in a city-pair route. For example, there were four city-pair routes from Augusta, Georgia; these connected, respectively, with Chicago; Louisville, Kentucky; Knoxville, Tennessee; and Washington, D.C.

In this case, we selected the Augusta/Chicago city-pair because it was the first city-pair route listed from Augusta.

Appendix III Objectives, Scope, and Methodology

After we selected the 52 routes, we found that service on 1 route had been discontinued. Because the route was discontinued, we excluded it from the routes that we tested for availability of reservations. To determine if we could get reservations at the government fare on the 51 routes, we telephoned Eastern and asked for seats on flights at the government fare for the day following our telephone call. We made our phone calls on April 11 and 12, 1990.

To answer question 7, we reviewed federal procurement laws, the FAR, the contract file for Eastern's prior contract, and interviewed the contracting officer who awarded Eastern's contract.

1111

## Major Contributors to This Fact Sheet

General Government Division, Washington, D.C. William Engel, Assistant Director, Government Business Operations Issues

Robert M. Antonio, Evaluator-in-Charge

Vernette R. Gilliam, Evaluator

Requests for copies of GAO reports should be sent to:

U.S. General Accounting Office Post Office Box 6015 Gaithersburg, Maryland 20877

Telephone 202-275-6241

The first five copies of each report are free. Additional copies are \$2.00 each.

There is a 25% discount on orders for 100 or more copies mailed to a single address.

Orders must be prepaid by cash or by check or money order made out to the Superintendent of Documents.

United States General Accounting Office Washington, D.C. 20548

Official Business Penalty for Private Use \$300 First-Class Mail Postage & Fees Paid GAO Permit No. G100