

United States General Accounting Office

Report to the Chairman, Senate Committee on Governmental Affairs

November 2003

ELECTRICITY RESTRUCTURING

2003 Blackout Identifies Crisis and Opportunity for the Electricity Sector



Contents

Appendix I	2003 Blackout Identifies Crisis and Opportunity for the Electricity Sector	5
Annondin	2002 Plackout Identifies Crisis and Opportunity for	
	Summary	1
Letter		1

This is a work of the U.S. government and is not subject to copyright protection in the United States. It may be reproduced and distributed in its entirety without further permission from GAO. However, because this work may contain copyrighted images or other material, permission from the copyright holder may be necessary if you wish to reproduce this material separately.



United States General Accounting Office Washington, DC 20548

November 18, 2003

The Honorable Susan M. Collins Chairman, Committee on Governmental Affairs United States Senate

Dear Chairman Collins:

The August 14, 2003, electricity blackout—the largest in the nation's history—affected millions of people across eight northeastern and midwestern states as well as areas in Canada. In some areas, power was restored in hours, while in others power was lost for several days. The blackout intensified concerns about the overall status and security of the electricity industry at a time when the industry is undergoing major changes and Americans have a heightened awareness of threats to security.

Because of these widespread concerns and the broad institutional interest of the Congress, we (1) highlighted information about the known causes and effects of the blackout, (2) summarized themes from prior GAO reports on electricity and security matters that provide a context for understanding the blackout, and (3) identified some of the potential options for resolving problems associated with these electricity and security matters.

Over the past several weeks, GAO staff briefed numerous congressional staff on its observations. In response to your request, we prepared this overview to accompany the slides used in these presentations. Appendix I presents the latest briefing slides in their entirety. Our briefing is based largely on reports we previously issued on a range of electricity issues along with updated information obtained from the Department of Energy (DOE), the North American Electric Reliability Council, and operators of the transmission system in the blackout region. The information presented is intended to place the electricity blackout in the broader context of longterm issues affecting the sector. The options presented do not encompass a complete set of all possible options but do represent ideas that merit consideration as the nation moves forward to address this important issue.

Summary

While the root cause of the blackout has not yet been conclusively established, a recent DOE report describes a sequence of events that culminated with the outage. A series of power plants and transmission lines went offline beginning at about noon eastern daylight time because of instability in the transmission system in three states. The loss of these plants and transmission lines led to greater instability in the regional power transmission system, which—4 hours later—resulted in a rapid cascade of additional plant and transmission line outages and widespread power outages. The blackout affected as many as 50 million customers in the United States and Canada, as well as a wide range of vital services and commerce. Air and ground transportation systems shut down, trapping people far from home; drinking water systems and sewage processing plants stopped operating; manufacturing was disrupted; and some emergency communications systems stopped functioning. The lost productivity and revenue have been estimated in the billions of dollars. A joint U. S.-Canadian taskforce is seeking to identify the root cause of the failures and plans to issue an interim report in November 2003.

Over the past several years, our work on the electricity sector has resulted in numerous findings, conclusions, observations, and recommendations. Based on this prior work, we highlight three themes on electricity and security matters in our briefing and lay out some of the potential options to consider in addressing problems in these areas.

Specifically:

Electricity markets are developing, but significant challenges remain. Our work has shown that while the electricity sector is in transition to competitive markets, the full benefits of these markets will take time and effort to achieve. For example, we found that the separate development of wholesale and retail electricity markets, which is occurring as part of the electricity industry shifts from regulated to competitive markets, limits the industry's ability to achieve the benefits of competition. The separate development of these markets reduces or eliminates retail consumers' incentive or ability to respond to market signals that supplies are tight. Consumers do not respond because the retail prices they see are set by state regulators and do not reflect actual market conditions. This lack of consumer response becomes particularly important during periods of high demand for electricity, such as hot summer afternoons, when total electricity use approaches the total amount of available generation. Efforts to promote various types of demand response, such as those that link customers' electricity consumption with prices, may offer one option for improving this situation. We are exploring this issue in more depth in

response to your request. Other issues raised by our work in this area are presented in slides 14 through 18 of the briefing.

- Oversight of markets and reliability needs more attention. The ongoing transition to competitive markets, or "restructuring" of electricity markets, has dramatically changed how the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC) needs to oversee these markets and the information it needs to do so. In order to monitor current market conditions to ensure fair competition, for example, FERC needs to access market information on wholesale transactions and the operation of electric generating plants, among other things. Our work shows that FERC's oversight efforts are improving, but it continues to be hampered by a number of challenges. In particular, we noted that FERC had previously not clearly defined its role in monitoring the market, faced gaps in information due to limitations in its jurisdictional authority, relied on third-party data to perform regulatory functions, and had limited enforcement authority. In addition, we pointed out that FERC faced human capital challenges to acquire and develop the staff knowledge and skill it needs to effectively regulate and oversee today's electricity market. Because restructuring has changed the types of information regulators need, we have previously recommended that FERC demonstrate what additional information it needs, describe the limitations it faces without such information, and ask the Congress for authority to collect it. One option for congressional action in this area includes providing FERC with authority to gain access to needed data relating to reliability and markets. Other issues raised by our work in this area are presented in slides 19 through 26 of the briefing.
- Security for critical infrastructure is of growing importance. Our work has shown that a reassessment of the security of the nation's physical infrastructure as well as that of related information technology and control systems should be undertaken. Often, security measures have been added after the infrastructure is in place, which is costly and creates potential conflicts between security and efficiency. Therefore, it may be better to integrate sufficient security measures for these critical systems, particularly in a post-September 11th environment, into the planning for new construction or the upgrading of existing infrastructure, rather than viewing them as later add-ons. Our work has also raised concerns about the increasing reliance on information technology and control systems, which are potentially vulnerable to cyber attack, including the systems used in the electricity sector. As part of our work, we have found that cyber attacks against these systems could be used to cause damage or complicate the response to a physical attack. One option to help address this problem would be to increase the focus on research and development and other related

activities, including the use of currently available technologies and vulnerability assessments, aimed at enhancing national capabilities to respond to cyber-security issues. Other aspects of our work in this area are presented in slides 27 through 29 of the briefing.

Whatever the ultimate cause of the blackout, our work has shown that a number of significant challenges remain for the electricity sector. We recognize that many issues surrounding the restructuring of the electricity industry are complicated and that solutions involve complex policy tradeoffs for the Congress that will undoubtedly take time to fully resolve. GAO stands ready to provide any analytical assistance the Congress may need in this important long-term endeavor.

We conducted our work in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards.

We are providing copies of this report to other appropriate congressional committees as well as DOE and FERC. The report will be available at no charge on the GAO Web site at http://www.gao.gov.

If you or your staff have any questions about this report, please contact me at (202) 512-3841. Major contributors to this report included Mary Acosta, Dennis Carroll, Dan Haas, Randy Jones, Mike Kaufman, Jon Ludwigson, and Barbara Timmerman.

Sincerely yours,

ion Wells

Jim Wells Director, National Resources and Environment

Appendix I: 2003 Blackout Identifies Crisis and Opportunity for the Electricity Sector























































Page 31






























GAO's Mission	The General Accounting Office, the audit, evaluation and investigative arm of Congress, exists to support Congress in meeting its constitutional responsibilities and to help improve the performance and accountability of the federal government for the American people. GAO examines the use of public funds; evaluates federal programs and policies; and provides analyses, recommendations, and other assistance to help Congress make informed oversight, policy, and funding decisions. GAO's commitment to good government is reflected in its core values of accountability, integrity, and reliability.		
Obtaining Copies of GAO Reports and Testimony	The fastest and easiest way to obtain copies of GAO documents at no cost is through the Internet. GAO's Web site (www.gao.gov) contains abstracts and full- text files of current reports and testimony and an expanding archive of older products. The Web site features a search engine to help you locate documents using key words and phrases. You can print these documents in their entirety, including charts and other graphics. Each day, GAO issues a list of newly released reports, testimony, and correspondence. GAO posts this list, known as "Today's Reports," on its Web site daily. The list contains links to the full-text document files. To have GAO e-mail this list to you every afternoon, go to www.gao.gov and select "Subscribe to e-mail alerts" under the "Order GAO Products" heading.		
Order by Mail or Phone	The first copy of each printed report is free. Additional copies are \$2 each. A check or money order should be made out to the Superintendent of Documents. GAO also accepts VISA and Mastercard. Orders for 100 or more copies mailed to a single address are discounted 25 percent. Orders should be sent to:		
	U.S. General Accounting O 441 G Street NW, Room LM Washington, D.C. 20548		
	To order by Phone: Voic TDI Fax):	(202) 512-6000 (202) 512-2537 (202) 512-6061
To Report Fraud,	Contact:		
Waste, and Abuse in Federal Programs	Web site: www.gao.gov/fraudnet/fraudnet.htm E-mail: fraudnet@gao.gov Automated answering system: (800) 424-5454 or (202) 512-7470		
Public Affairs	Jeff Nelligan, Managing Director, <u>NelliganJ@gao.gov</u> (202) 512-4800 U.S. General Accounting Office, 441 G Street NW, Room 7149 Washington, D.C. 20548		