

RESTRICTED — Not to be released outside the General Accounting Office except on the basis of specific approval by the Office of Congressional Relations, a record of which is kept by the Distribution Section, Publications Branch, OAS

3.07.35
73-0079



COMPTROLLER GENERAL OF THE UNITED STATES
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20548

RELEASED

B-164031(1)

FEB 15 1973

Dear Senator Kennedy:

In accordance with your request of July 19, 1972, and subsequent discussions with your office, we reviewed selected projects under the Bilingual Education program authorized by title VII of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965. As agreed, we determined the type of instruction being received by students in these projects, particularly the amount of class time devoted to teaching English as a second language and to other academic subjects in the dominant language of the children. We did not evaluate the effectiveness of the projects.

We reviewed a total of 28 bilingual education projects which were conducted by local education agencies under grants awarded by the Office of Education, Department of Health, Education, and Welfare. The projects were located in urban and rural communities in Arizona, California, New Mexico, New York, and Texas. Although several ethnic groups were served, the majority of the projects were directed toward Mexican-American children whose dominant language was Spanish.

The 28 projects involved a total of 105 schools with a total project enrollment of 16,644 students. We visited and obtained information from 46 of these schools with a total project enrollment of 7,954.

A summary showing for the schools we visited the number of students by dominant language and the type of classroom instruction on a percentage basis is presented below:

<u>Program enrollment</u>		<u>Instruction time</u>			
		<u>Second language instruction</u>		<u>Academic subjects taught in</u>	
<u>Language dominance</u>	<u>Number of students</u>	<u>English</u>	<u>Spanish (or other)¹</u>	<u>English</u>	<u>Spanish (or other)¹</u>
Spanish (or other) ¹	3,135	29%	None	26%	45%
Bilingual	2,904	None	None	71%	29%
English	1,915	None	16%	75%	9%

¹Other dominant languages of students served by projects include Navajo/Zuni, Chinese, and Portuguese (one project each).

954517
090524

It should be noted that the amount of time devoted to each category of instruction varied widely from grade to grade and from project to project. For example, the proportion of classroom time devoted to teaching academic subjects in Spanish to children having Spanish as a dominant language ranged from a low of 28 percent in one project to a high of 79 percent in another. We did not attempt to evaluate the reasons for the variances. Detailed schedules are attached which show instruction time by individual projects (enclosure I) and by grade level for all projects (enclosure II). We have also enclosed for your information certain background data, such as funding and student enrollment, for each of the projects (enclosure III).

Definitions used for classifying students by language dominance and the type of instruction were:

Spanish (or other)-dominant student - One who learns better in Spanish or some other language other than English. Child may be monolingual Spanish (or other) or speak some English.

English-dominant student - One who learns better in English. Child may be monolingual English or speak another language to some extent.

Bilingual student - One who has approximately equal ability in each of two languages and learns in both with about equal facility. Included in this category are students who may have a strong learning ability in both English and another language, as well as those who may be weak in both languages. By definition, these students do not receive second language instruction.

English as a second language - A specified period where English is taught to Spanish (or other)-dominant students as a second language through language arts activities such as reading, writing, speaking, or listening exercises.

Spanish (or other) as a second language - Same as English as a second language, except the second language is Spanish or another project language and is taught to English-dominant students.

Academic subjects - Includes subjects such as math, science, social studies, art, and music, other than language taught as a second language, whether or not taught in the child's dominant language. For example, a Spanish class is categorized as an academic subject for the Spanish-dominant student.

The data contained in the schedules is based on estimates developed primarily from classroom observations made at project schools, supplemented by discussions with teachers. Because of divergent teaching methods, varying numbers of students, and differences in total

instruction time among schools in the projects, to arrive at the percentage of instructional time shown for second language and for academic subjects, we weighted the data on the basis of the number of children participating in each class, each grade, and each project. The results of the work were discussed with project directors and school administrators who generally agreed with our observations.

As agreed with your office, we did not ask Office of Education officials to formally comment on the enclosed data; however, we discussed it with them at the completion of the review and they concurred with the results of our work. We plan to make no further distribution of the data unless specific requests are received, and then we shall make distribution only if you agree or publicly announce the information.

Sincerely yours,



Comptroller General
of the United States

Enclosures - 3

The Honorable Edward M. Kennedy
United States Senate

SUMMARY BY PROJECT OF TYPE OF INSTRUCTION
RECEIVED BY STUDENTS AT 46 SCHOOLS ENROLLED IN 28 BILINGUAL
EDUCATION PROJECTS REVIEWED BY GAO

	<u>Program enrollment</u>		<u>Percentage of instruction time¹</u>			
			<u>Second language instruction</u>		<u>Academic subjects taught in</u>	
	<u>Language dominance</u>	<u>Number of students</u>	<u>English</u>	<u>Spanish (or other)</u>	<u>English</u>	<u>Spanish (or other)</u>
<u>Arizona</u>						
Project 265	Spanish	42	19	-	51	30
	Bilingual	207	-	-	77	23
	English	90	-	20	77	3
<u>California</u>						
Project 65	Spanish	11	19	-	28	53
	Bilingual	23	-	-	77	23
	English	61	-	9	78	13
Project 141	Spanish	57	21	-	28	51
	Bilingual	44	-	-	56	44
	English	38	-	20	50	30
Project 221	Chinese	82	40	-	24	36
	Bilingual	39	-	-	63	37
	English	78	-	15	66	19
Project 222	Spanish	94	19	-	19	62
	Bilingual	22	-	-	57	43
	English	101	-	19	63	18
Project 229	Spanish	25	20	-	41	39
	Bilingual	105	-	-	81	19
	English	72	-	8	92	-
Project 272	Portuguese	24	29	-	21	50
	Bilingual	63	-	-	65	35
	English	49	-	27	72	1
Project 347	Spanish	74	14	-	25	61
	Bilingual	63	-	-	60	40
	English	167	-	11	80	9
Project 441	Spanish	51	14	-	20	66
	Bilingual	63	-	-	65	35
	English	195	-	11	82	7

ENCLOSURE I

			<u>Percentage of instruction time¹</u>			
			<u>Program enrollment</u>		<u>Second language instruction</u>	
	<u>Language dominance</u>	<u>Number of students</u>	<u>English</u>	<u>Spanish (or other)</u>	<u>English</u>	<u>Spanish (or other)</u>
<u>California (Con't.)</u>						
Project 451	Spanish	32	10	-	13	77
	Bilingual	13	-	-	69	31
	English	34	-	10	80	10
Project 504	Spanish	22	17	-	52	31
	Bilingual	75	-	-	76	24
	English	70	-	19	76	5
Project 615	Spanish	16	15	-	6	79
	Bilingual	60	-	-	52	48
	English	101	-	22	71	7
Project 646	Spanish	13	21	-	24	55
	Bilingual	13	-	-	56	44
	English	59	-	19	61	20
Project 727	Spanish	39	20	-	33	47
	Bilingual	69	-	-	52	48
	English	76	-	20	75	5
<u>New Mexico</u>						
Project 609	Navajo/Zuni	115	28	-	35	37
	Bilingual	31	-	-	84	16
	English	29	-	11	82	7
<u>New York</u>						
Project 312	Spanish	193	25	-	18	57
	Bilingual	43	-	-	61	39
	English	201	-	18	69	13
Project 596	Spanish	25	19	-	36	45
	Bilingual	29	-	-	61	39
	English	22	-	12	71	17
Project 617	Spanish	87	18	-	18	64
	Bilingual	96	-	-	67	33
	English	71	-	15	80	5
Project 655	Spanish	152	29	-	8	63
	Bilingual	219	-	-	60	40
	English	11	-	16	83	1

ENCLOSURE I

	<u>Program enrollment</u>		<u>Percentage of instruction time¹</u>			
			<u>Second language instruction</u>		<u>Academic subjects taught in</u>	
	<u>Language dominance</u>	<u>Number of students</u>	<u>English</u>	<u>Spanish (or other)</u>	<u>English</u>	<u>Spanish (or other)</u>
<u>Texas</u>						
Project 6	Spanish	169	32	-	36	32
	Bilingual	39	-	-	74	26
	English	18	-	21	73	6
Project 53	Spanish	486	29	-	32	39
	Bilingual	620	-	-	82	18
	English	95	-	9	85	6
Project 60	Spanish	92	34	-	38	28
	Bilingual	169	-	-	73	27
	English	112	-	15	75	10
Project 114	Spanish	155	35	-	32	33
	Bilingual	72	-	-	70	30
	English	2	-	18	66	16
Project 164	Spanish	179	28	-	30	42
	Bilingual	69	-	-	92	8
	English	7	-	22	63	15
Project 411	Spanish	20	35	-	21	44
	Bilingual	65	-	-	66	34
	English	99	-	35	64	1
Project 483	Spanish	68	30	-	10	60
	Bilingual	140	-	-	57	43
	English	7	-	21	64	15
Project 515	Spanish	580	29	-	22	49
	Bilingual	242	-	-	63	37
	English	44	-	26	64	10
Project 572	Spanish	232	42	-	19	39
	Bilingual	211	-	-	75	25
	English	6	-	17	73	10

¹These percentages represent weighted averages based on the number of students participating in each classroom and each grade level.

SUMMARY BY GRADE LEVEL OF TYPE OF INSTRUCTION
RECEIVED BY STUDENTS AT 46 SCHOOLS ENROLLED IN 28 BILINGUAL
EDUCATION PROJECTS REVIEWED BY GAO

	<u>Program enrollment</u>		<u>Percentage of instruction time¹</u>			
			<u>Second language instruction</u>		<u>Academic subjects taught in</u>	
			<u>Language dominance</u>	<u>Number of students</u>	<u>English</u>	<u>Spanish (or other)</u>
<u>Pre-kindergarten</u>	Spanish (or other)	10	23	-	14	63
	Bilingual	21	-	-	54	46
	English	51	-	46	54	-
<u>Kindergarten</u>	Spanish (or other)	815	25	-	19	56
	Bilingual	252	-	-	57	43
	English	336	-	22	66	12
<u>Grade 1</u>	Spanish (or other)	739	29	-	22	49
	Bilingual	470	-	-	67	33
	English	367	-	19	71	10
<u>Grade 2</u>	Spanish (or other)	555	31	-	23	46
	Bilingual	493	-	-	70	30
	English	270	-	14	77	9
<u>Grade 3</u>	Spanish (or other)	427	32	-	30	38
	Bilingual	653	-	-	74	26
	English	260	-	15	76	9
<u>Grade 4</u>	Spanish (or other)	242	29	-	37	34
	Bilingual	350	-	-	74	26
	English	220	-	11	79	10
<u>Grade 5</u>	Spanish (or other)	90	31	-	22	47
	Bilingual	58	-	-	67	33
	English	55	-	18	72	10
<u>Grade 6</u>	Spanish (or other)	120	32	-	21	47
	Bilingual	81	-	-	76	24
	English	78	-	14	86	-

ENCLOSURE II

	<u>Program enrollment</u>	<u>Percentage of instruction time</u> ¹					
		<u>Language dominance</u>	<u>Number of students</u>	<u>Second language instruction</u>		<u>Academic subjects taught in</u>	
				<u>English</u>	<u>Spanish (or other)</u>	<u>English</u>	<u>Spanish (or other)</u>
<u>Grade 7</u>	Spanish (or other)	41	23	-	50	27	
	Bilingual	173	-	-	78	22	
	English	32	-	19	77	4	
<u>Grade 8</u>	Spanish (or other)	7	16	-	55	29	
	Bilingual	27	-	-	80	20	
	English	14	-	16	80	4	
<u>Grade 9</u>	Spanish (or other)	62	19	-	38	43	
	Bilingual	175	-	-	67	33	
	English	138	-	20	75	5	
<u>Grade 10</u>	Spanish (or other)	16	19	-	52	29	
	Bilingual	92	-	-	75	25	
	English	59	-	13	73	14	
<u>Grade 11</u>	Spanish (or other)	9	20	-	60	20	
	Bilingual	33	-	-	79	21	
	English	28	-	15	79	6	
<u>Grade 12</u>	Spanish (or other)	2	-	-	80	20	
	Bilingual	26	-	-	79	21	
	English	7	-	8	77	15	

¹These percentages represent weighted averages based on the number of students in each classroom and each project.

SUMMARY OF BACKGR
ON 28 BILINGUAL EDUCATI
IN GAO'S REVIEW AND

	<u>School district/city</u>	<u>Project area</u>	<u>Ethnic group served</u>	<u>Year of operation</u>	<u>\$</u>
<u>Arizona</u>					
Project 265	Phoenix Union High School System, Phoenix	Urban	Mexican	Fourth	\$
<u>California</u>					
Project 65	Healdsburg Union Elementary School District, Healdsburg	Rural	Mexican	Fourth	
Project 141	Redwood City School District, Redwood City	Urban	Mexican	Fourth	
Project 221	San Francisco Unified School District, San Francisco	Urban	Chinese	Fourth	
Project 222	Los Angeles City Unified School District, Los Angeles	Urban	Mexican	Third	
Project 229	Compton Unified School District, Compton	Urban	Mexican	Fourth	
Project 272	ABC Unified School District, Artesia	Urban	Portuguese	Fourth	
Project 347	El Rancho Unified School District, Pico Rivera	Urban	Mexican	Third	

ENCLOSURE III

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION
 ON PROJECTS INCLUDED
 SCOPE OF REVIEW

<u>Funding</u>		<u>No. of project schools</u>	<u>Total project enrollment</u>	<u>Scope of review</u>		
<u>School year 1972-73</u>	<u>Cumulative</u>			<u>No. of schools visited</u>	<u>Grades covered</u>	<u>No. of students observed</u>
40,550	\$ 310,178	1	339	1	9 thru 12	339
46,105	191,990	2	95	2	1 thru 4	95
56,070	185,740	1	139	1	K thru 4	139
226,560	690,880	2	247	2	1 thru 4	199
526,855	1,484,340	5	1,710	1	K thru 3	217
102,401	374,803	1	202	1	2 thru 4	202
97,807	300,939	1	136	1	K thru 6	136
230,000	714,425	1	304	1	K thru 4	304

	<u>School district/city</u>	<u>Project area</u>	<u>Ethnic group served</u>	<u>Year of operation</u>	<u>Sc</u>
<u>California con't</u>					
Project 441	Montebello Unified School District, Montebello	Urban	Mexican	Third	
Project 451	Gilroy Unified School District, Gilroy	Rural	Mexican	Third	
Project 504	Orange Unified School District, Orange	Urban	Mexican	Third	
Project 615	New Haven Unified School District, Union City	Urban	Mexican	Second	
Project 646	Washington Unified School District, West Sacramento	Rural	Mexican	Third	
Project 727	Oxnard Union High School District, Oxnard	Urban	Mexican	First	
<u>New Mexico</u>					
Project 609	Gallup-McKinley County School District, Gallup	Rural	Indian	Second	
<u>New York</u>					
Project 312	New York City School District #7, New York	Urban	Puerto Rican	Fourth	
Project 596	New York City School District #1, New York	Urban	Puerto Rican	Second	
Project 617	North Rockland Central School District, Stony Point	Urban	Puerto Rican	Second	
Project 655	New York City School District #6, New York	Urban	Puerto Rican-Dominican	Second	

ENCLOSURE III

<u>Funding</u>		<u>No. of project schools</u>	<u>Total project enrollment</u>	<u>Scope of review</u>		
<u>1972-73</u>	<u>Cumulative</u>			<u>No. of schools visited</u>	<u>Grades covered</u>	<u>No. of students observed</u>
220,000	659,102	3	1,059	1	K thru 4	309
59,570	166,226	1	79	1	K thru 2	79
84,790	223,508	4	167	4	7 thru 10	167
215,000	401,950	4	640	1	K thru 3	177
80,600	150,700	10	780	1	K thru 2	85
100,000	100,000	1	184	1	9	184
102,646	202,646	4	175	4	K and 1	175
238,000	992,251	1	847	1	K thru 6	437
176,250	351,250	3	278	1	K thru 3	76
128,519	283,519	1	254	1	K thru 3	254
143,750	268,750	4	765	1	K thru 6	382

	<u>School district/city</u>	<u>Project area</u>	<u>Ethnic group served</u>	<u>Year of operation</u>
<u>Texas</u>				
Project 6	Zapata County Independent School District, Zapata	Rural	Mexican	Fourth
Project 53	Weslaco Independent School District, Weslaco	Rural	Mexican	Fourth
Project 60	San Antonio Independent School District, San Antonio	Urban	Mexican	Fourth
Project 114	McAllen Independent School District, McAllen	Rural	Mexican	Fourth
Project 164	Laredo Independent School District, Laredo	Rural	Mexican	Fourth
Project 411	Alamo Heights Independent School District, San Antonio	Urban	Mexican	Third
Project 483	South San Antonio Independent School District, San Antonio	Urban	Mexican	Third
Project 515	Crystal City Independent School District, Crystal City	Rural	Mexican	Second
Project 572	Pharr-San Juan-Alamo Independent School District, Pharr	Rural	Mexican	Second

Total

ENCLOSURE III

<u>Funding</u>		<u>No. of project schools</u>	<u>Total project enrollment</u>	<u>Scope of review</u>		
<u>School year 1972-73</u>	<u>Cumulative</u>			<u>No. of schools visited</u>	<u>Grades covered</u>	<u>No. of students observed</u>
115,000	356,057	2	611	2	K thru 5	226
141,937	392,951	4	1,201	4	K thru 4	1,201
400,000	1,393,169	19	1,541	4	K, 1, 6, 7, & 10 thru 12	373
109,419	358,635	6	821	1	1 thru 4	229
88,450	353,723	4	450	2	K thru 7	255
120,349	366,405	2	184	2	Pre-K thru 2	184
117,400	231,347	4	880	1	K thru 3	215
175,000	337,000	3	866	2	K thru 3	866
179,840	319,802	11	1,690	1	K thru 3	449
<u>\$4,322,868</u>	<u>\$12,162,286</u>	<u>105</u>	<u>16,644</u>	<u>46</u>		<u>7,954</u>

ENCLOSURE III

Funding		No. of project schools	Total project enrollment	Scope of review		
School year 1972-73	Cumulative			No. of schools visited	Grades covered	No. of students observed
115,000	356,057	2	611	2	K thru 5	226
141,937	392,951	4	1,201	4	K thru 4	1,201
400,000	1,393,169	19	1,541	4	K, 1, 6, 7, & 10 thru 12	373
109,419	358,635	6	821	1	1 thru 4	229
88,450	353,723	4	450	2	K thru 7	255
120,349	366,405	2	184	2	Pre-K thru 2	184
117,400	231,347	4	880	1	K thru 3	215
175,000	337,000	3	866	2	K thru 3	866
179,840	319,802	11	1,690	1	K thru 3	449
<u>\$4,322,868</u>	<u>\$12,162,286</u>	<u>105</u>	<u>16,644</u>	<u>46</u>		<u>7,954</u>