

Highlights of GAO-04-83, a report to congressional requesters

Why GAO Did This Study

There is a growing understanding that the federal government needs to fundamentally rethink its current approach to pay and to better link pay to individual and organizational performance. Federal agencies have been experimenting with pay for performance through the Office of Personnel Management's (OPM) personnel demonstration projects.

GAO identified the approaches that selected personnel demonstration projects have taken to implement their pay for performance systems. These projects include: the Navy Demonstration Project at China Lake (China Lake), the National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST), the Department of Commerce (DOC), the Naval Research Laboratory (NRL), the Naval Sea Systems **Command Warfare Centers** (NAVSEA) at Dahlgren and Newport, and the Civilian Acquisition Workforce Personnel Demonstration Project (AcqDemo). We selected these demonstration projects based on factors such as status of the project and makeup of employee groups covered.

We provided drafts of this report to officials in the Department of Defense (DOD) and DOC for their review and comment. DOD provided written comments concurring with our report. DOC provided minor technical clarifications and updated information. We provided a draft of the report to the Director of OPM for her information.

www.gao.gov/cgi-bin/getrpt?GAO-04-83.

To view the full product, including the scope and methodology, click on the link above. For more information, contact J. Christopher Mihm at (202) 512-6806 or mihmj@gao.gov.

HUMAN CAPITAL

Implementing Pay for Performance at Selected Personnel Demonstration Projects

What GAO Found

The demonstration projects took a variety of approaches to designing and implementing their pay for performance systems to meet the unique needs of their cultures and organizational structures, as shown in the table below.

Demonstration Project Approaches to Implementing Pay for Performance

Using competencies to evaluate employee performance.

High-performing organizations use validated core competencies as a key part of evaluating individual contributions to organizational results. To this end, AcqDemo and NRL use core competencies for all positions. Other demonstration projects, such as NIST, DOC, and China Lake, use competencies based on the individual employee's position.

Translating employee performance ratings into pay increases and awards.

Some projects, such as China Lake and NAVSEA's Newport division, established predetermined pay increases, awards, or both depending on a given performance rating, while others, such as DOC and NIST, delegated the flexibility to individual pay pools to determine how ratings would translate into performance pay increases, awards, or both. The demonstration projects made some distinctions among employees' performance.

Considering current salary in making performance-based pay decisions.

Several of the demonstration projects, such as AcqDemo and NRL, consider an employee's current salary when making performance pay increases and award decisions to make a better match between an employee's compensation and contribution to the organization.

Managing costs of the pay for performance system.

According to officials, salaries, training, and automation and data systems were the major cost drivers of implementing their pay for performance systems. The demonstration projects used a number of approaches to manage the costs.

Providing information to employees about the results of performance appraisal and pay decisions.

To ensure fairness and safeguard against abuse, performance-based pay programs should have adequate safeguards, including reasonable transparency in connection with the results of the performance management process. To this end, several of the demonstration projects publish information, such as the average performance rating, performance pay increase, and award.

Source: GAO.

GAO strongly supports the need to expand pay for performance in the federal government. How it is done, when it is done, and the basis on which it is done can make all the difference in whether such efforts are successful. High-performing organizations continuously review and revise their performance management systems. These demonstration projects show an understanding that how to better link pay to performance is very much a work in progress at the federal level. Additional work is needed to strengthen efforts to ensure that performance management systems are tools to help them manage on a day-to-day basis. In particular, there are opportunities to use organizationwide competencies to evaluate employee performance that reinforce behaviors and actions that support the organization's mission, translate employee performance so that managers make meaningful distinctions between top and poor performers with objective and fact-based information, and provide information to employees about the results of the performance appraisals and pay decisions to ensure reasonable transparency and appropriate accountability mechanisms are in place.